



**Asia-Pacific
Economic Cooperation**

2010/SOM1/SCSC/011

Agenda Item: 4 (4)

APEC Toy Safety Initiative – Open Dialogue on Toy Safety for All Stakeholders Report

Purpose: Information
Submitted by: United States



JAPAN 2010

**First Sub-Committee on Standards and
Conformance Meeting
Hiroshima, Japan
6-7 March 2010**

APEC Subcommittee on Standards and Conformance
APEC Toy Safety Initiative: Open Dialogue on Toy Safety for All Stakeholders.
Report to the SCSC

Background

At the meeting in September 2007 in Sydney, APEC Leaders declared a commitment to “strengthen consumer product safety standards and practices in the region, using scientific risk-based approaches and without creating unnecessary impediments to trade.” At the November 2008 Leaders Meeting in Peru, the commitment to consumer product safety was reaffirmed, “We recognize the importance of improving current standards and practices in this area, and direct officials to take steps in this regard, including by undertaking work to ensure the safety of toys in 2009.”

In response to Leaders, the SCSC launched the APEC Toy Safety Initiative in partnership with the U.S. Toy Industry Association. The first element of the APEC Toy Safety Initiative, “A Regulator Dialogue on Toy Safety”, was held on the margins of the Singapore SCSC meeting August 1-2, 2009 in Singapore. (See 2009/SOM2/SCSC/033.) Building on the success of the Regulator Dialogue, the United States and the cosponsoring economies reviewed the Singapore outcomes with the aim of engaging all toy industry stakeholders to strengthen toy safety systems while facilitating trade in safe toys. This report summarizes the discussions and outcomes of the APEC Toy Safety Initiative’s “Open Dialogue on Toy Safety for All Stakeholders” held in Hong Kong, China on January 12, 2010.

The Open Dialogue on Toy Safety for All Stakeholders

These two Dialogues marked the first-ever meetings of all toy industry stakeholders within the APEC region, home to over 85% of all toy manufacturers and exporters, to discuss opportunities and obstacles to greater global alignment of toy safety standards and improving toy safety conformity assessment systems.

The Open Dialogue, sponsored by APEC, the U.S. Toy Industry Association, and the Hong Kong Trade Development Council, was held in coordination with the Hong Kong Toy Fair on January 12, 2010. Nineteen of the 21 member economies participated¹ and 11 served as speakers². APEC approval was granted to allow for attendance by representatives from India, EU member states, (Belgium, Denmark, and Sweden), the European Commission, and Switzerland. The publically available presentations and documents are located on the Toy Industry Association and APEC Meeting Document Database websites³.

Chinese Vice Minister Wei of the General Administration of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine (AQSIQ) Chairman Tenenbaum of the U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission, and EU Commissioner for Consumer Protection Kuneva, provided keynote addresses at the Open Dialogue in Hong Kong. Mr. Gerald Storch, CEO of the American company Toys R US, provided closing remarks on standards alignment from a retailer’s perspective.

Targeted Outcomes of CTI/18 2009T (as envisioned in the project proposal)

This project will bring together and educate manufacturers, testing companies, government regulators, and toy trade associations from APEC member economies.

- The Open Dialogue in Hong Kong attracted 214 registered participants: 46 percent represented toy manufacturers or toy associations; 32 percent represented APEC economies

¹ Brunei and Russia did not send representatives.

² Australia, Canada, China, Hong Kong, China, Indonesia, Japan, Malaysia, Mexico, New Zealand, United States, and Vietnam plus European representatives from the European Commission, the ISO 8124 Technical Committee, Chairman of the CEN Technical Committee 52, and the World Trade Organization.

³ The Singapore and Hong Kong documents can be found on the APEC Meeting Document Database at: <http://aimp.apec.org/MDDB/default.aspx>. The Hong Kong documents are also available on the Toy Industry Association website at: <http://www.toyassociation.org>.

or EU member states; and 22 percent represented testing companies, standards bodies or consumer groups.

The workshops will educate stakeholders about complying with the relevant toy safety systems. Additionally, the member economies that participate in the workshops will be able to share ideas and current practices and learn from the knowledge and experience of other members. The government officials' participation in these workshops will support the Leader's commitment to strengthen consumer product safety standards and practices in the region using scientific risk-based approaches without creating unnecessary impediments to trade.

- There was discussion on the regulatory systems of eight members, and the relationship between the three main toy standards, ASTM F963, EN-71, and ISO 8124. The EU was included because of the important role that the EU toy safety standard, EN-71, plays in APEC economies.

The inventory of regulatory practices developed from the first workshop will inform the design of the second workshop. This document and the evaluation reports from both activities will better inform the SCSC, government regulators, toy industry officials, other interested stakeholders on the current state-of-play within and across APEC's member economies.

- The United States, in coordination with the cosponsoring economies and the Singapore participants, created the APEC Toy Safety Survey in September of 2009. It was circulated to economy regulators and APEC SCSC representatives in early October. All 21 member economies responded. From early November through late December, the Project Overseer clarified survey responses and cleared the survey compilation document with regulators and the SCSC.
- The survey is an important product of the APEC Toy Safety Initiative and will be shared with the OECD, the World Trade Organization's Technical Barriers to Trade Committee, the [International Consumer Product Health and Safety Organization](#) (ICPHSO), the ISO Committee on Consumer Policy (COPOLCO), and the Chairs of the ASTM, CEN, and ISO technical committees on toy safety. APEC economies are encouraged to share the survey results with interested toy industry stakeholders.
- The key survey results include the following findings:
 - a. The majority of APEC economies use voluntary standards as reference standards in technical regulations and are engaged in voluntary standards work. Eighteen of the 21 APEC economies mandate toy safety standards: 13 reference ISO 8124; 10 reference EN-71; and 8 reference ASTM F963⁴.
 - b. Of those 18, 10 specify safety requirements in mandatory safety standards and or regulations and eight use a mixture of mandatory standards and a general requirement for toys to be safe.
 - c. Six economies require mandatory risk assessments be carried out before toys can be placed on the market.
 - d. The survey asked the following questions regarding economies' usage of tools regulating the sale of toys for safety purposes:
 - i. Five require licensing of businesses, distributors, or retailers involved in toy manufacturing.
 - ii. Eleven require the use of a safety mark, seal, or other statement that is a claim of conformity or safety.

⁴ Three economies have a general product safety regime where all goods placed on the market are required to be safe, but they do not mandate the use of toy safety standards: Brunei, Papua New Guinea, and Singapore. Note that in some cases economies reference all three.

- iii. Four require the use of a third party certification mark; three of which are government appointed third parties.
 - iv. Fifteen require the use of tracking or traceability labels for toys to help identify products in case hazards are discovered and one economy plans to introduce such requirements in the near future⁵.
- e. Ten of the 19 economies that responded to the question stated that there is a requirement to report product hazards to the regulatory authority. While most required the domestic manufacturer and importer to report the problem, not all required reporting from the distributor or retailer.
- f. Nineteen of the 21 economies reported that their regulatory bodies have the authority to order product recalls and ban unsafe products and all but two of those have the authority to introduce mandatory standards.

The information gathered under this initiative will increase transparency, encourage better alignment and reduce unnecessary impediments to trade related to toy safety standards and practices in the APEC region.

- The APEC Toy Safety Initiative has increased the transparency of the regulatory approaches of APEC members and the power point presentations, reports, and survey results serve as important references on how economies regulate. These documents also provide information of the types of measures that are effective and efficient in achieving the objective of safe toys and do not create unnecessary obstacles to trade.
- The survey results provide the baseline information necessary for efforts to encourage better standards alignment. The results illustrate that most APEC economies reference one of the three main toy standards (ISO, EN or ASTM). Collaboration and cooperation among the technical committees in making changes to these voluntary standards, either by amending for emerging hazards or to reconcile historical divergences, would bring about closer alignment for the majority of APEC economies.
- The project contributed to efforts to resolve specific trade concerns and reduce unnecessary impediments to trade related to toy safety measures. Example: following the Singapore meeting, Malaysia announced changes to its new conformity assessment system on toys to address concerns that had been raised by numerous countries, including some APEC economies, at the WTO Committee on Technical Barrier to Trade.

Outcomes and Next Steps

The APEC Toy Safety Initiative has advanced regulatory cooperation both within, and outside APEC, and helped to initiate relationships between regulators, standards experts, and industry stakeholders that will further the project's goals in other international fora.

In September 2009, regulators from APEC and non-APEC economies met in Stockholm, Sweden for the first-ever global regulators conference focusing on product traceability and tracking labels under the auspices of the International Consumer Product Safety Caucus⁶. In February, 2010, regulators, stakeholders met again during the International Health and Consumer Product Safety Organization⁷ meeting in Washington, DC and were briefed on the results of the APEC Toy Safety Survey during the keynote address by Richard O'Brien of the U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission.

⁵ The survey outlines the details economies require on the tracking labels: name of manufacturer or importer; country of origin; batch or serial number; and date or month of production.

⁶ The ICPSC is a platform to facilitate the exchange of information on consumer product safety issues in the area of governmental policy, legislation and market surveillance with a view to strengthening the collaboration and cooperation among governments and regulatory agencies around the world. <http://www.icpsc.org>

⁷ ICPHSO: <http://www.icphso.org/events.html>

Standards Body Cooperation and the ISO Advisory Panel

A notable outcome from the APEC Toy Safety Initiative occurred following interaction among participants, including the chairmen of the ISO and ASTM technical committees, at the *Regulator Dialogue* in Singapore. In November, the experts on the technical committees from ASTM and ISO pledged to support greater technical cooperation and agreed to hold future joint meetings when possible. ISO Technical Committee on Toy Safety (ISO TC/181) delegates were invited to attend and fully participate in reviewing proposed changes to ASTM F963. Representatives from 17 countries, including some APEC economies, joined with members of the ASTM F15.22 committee to explore enhancements to technical standards that could address potential toy hazards related to impaction, magnets and projectiles.

As a result, a resolution was proposed and adopted by the ISO Technical Committee to establish an Advisory Panel to determine priorities for the ISO Technical Committee. This Advisory Panel will facilitate increased cooperation among toy standard setting bodies in the interest of promoting better standards alignment and avoiding development of further divergences among major toy standards. The initial tasks of the Advisory Panel include:

- Early identification and monitoring of emerging issues
- Creation and updating of a list of these issues
- Recommending to ISO/TC 181 to adopt preliminary work items or proposals for new work as relevant

The ISO Advisory Panel is comprised of ISO technical experts. In addition, other major standard bodies, economies, and a range of stakeholders including consumer groups are represented on the Advisory Panel. Two speakers from the Open Dialogue participate in the ISO Advisory Panel: Christian Wetterberg, Chairman of ISO/TC 181, and Peter Trillingsgaard, Chairman of CEN TC 52. With the establishment of the ISO Advisory Panel, international fora are now established for each of the major stakeholders necessary to further work on toy standards alignment:

- Standard Setting Organizations – ISO Advisory Panel
- Regulators – International Consumer Product Safety Caucus (ICPSC)
- Toy Industry – International Counsel of Toy Industries (ICTI)
- Consumer Interests -- ISO Committee on Consumer Policy (COPOLCO)⁸

Next Steps

Following the Hong Kong Meeting, New Zealand circulated a letter to the Open Dialogue participants requesting ideas for next steps that could facilitate standards alignment, but which could be realized in the near term, with an eye towards reconvening participants of the APEC Toy Safety Initiative on the margins of the International Health and Consumer Product Safety Caucus in 2011. After an initial review of the suggestions, the following two are recommended to the APEC SCSC as achievable near term activities⁹.

- Establish a contact list of government and regulatory toy safety experts in APEC jurisdictions and make the list available on a centralized IT platform (a project that might be undertaken in cooperation with OECD's Consumer Policy Committee, since it aligns with recommendations in its recent report on information sharing).
- Draft and circulate among APEC economies a list of "Successful Market Surveillance Practices."

⁸ Representatives from the ISO COPOLCO Committee participated in both workshops; in the Singapore Regulator Dialogue as a participant and in the Hong Kong Open Dialogue as a speaker.

⁹ The complete list is included as an appendix to this report.

The Project Overseer will continue to work with New Zealand, as well as other interested economies, in establishing a timetable for advancement of these and other suggested tasks that are deemed ripe and appropriate to further the work on toy safety established under the Initiative.

Several economies noted the need for an information system that would share public product safety recall and alert information from multiple jurisdictions. This effort began in the OECD, and most recently the International Consumer Product Safety Caucus has agreed to work closely with OECD in that effort. The Project Overseer will continue to monitor the progress on this issue.

Summary of the Hong Kong Open Dialogue Event

Mr. Bernie Ting, Chairman of the Hong Kong Toys Council, opened the event by welcoming participants to the Hong Kong Toy Fair. Ms. Julia Doherty, Vice Chair, APEC SCSC, introduced the three keynote speakers.

Vice Minister, Wei Chuanzhong, General Administration of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine, People's Republic of China: Vice Minister Wei introduced briefly that China is the world's largest toy producer and exporter and Chinese Government adopted strict management measures on export and domestic toys in order to protect children's health and safety. He stressed that AQSIQ attaches great importance to international cooperation on toy safety and to the established cooperative mechanism with the European Union, the United States, Canada, Japan, and Germany. He called for economies to pay attention to safety management throughout the industry chain, to harmonize technical standards as well as to enhance mutual trust and cooperation among the governments.

Chairman Inez Tenenbaum, U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission¹⁰: Chairman Tenenbaum noted that the vast majority of toys consumed in the United States are imported from APEC economies and encouraged international regulators to build upon the work undertaken by the APEC Toy Safety Initiative. She suggested that as a first step towards alignment, existing toy standards should be modified to address the following emerging toy hazards: choking hazards; powerful magnets that can be swallowed and create a deadly blockage in the small intestines; lead, cadmium, and other dangerous metals; strangulation hazards; sharp points and projectiles; and dangerous chemicals.

She outlined recent changes under the Consumer Product Safety Improvement Act (CPSIA) and indicated that the U.S. CPSC will be looking to find ways to harmonize the U.S. approach with its global partners unless cultural, economic, or other legitimate considerations warrant a unique solution. She closed her remarks by emphasizing CPSC's intention to focus on international cooperation with China, Europe, and other key economies as the CPSC goes forward with its implementation of the CPSIA.

Commissioner Meglena Kuneva, EU Commissioner for Consumer Protection: Commissioner Kuneva outlined recent changes to the EU Toy Safety Directive but noted that due to the complexity of today's global supply chains, it is no longer practical to undertake enforcement on a national, or even on a regional basis. She highlighted key bilateral relationships with AQSIQ and the CPSC but also noted the importance of trilateral cooperation. She encouraged regulators to advance the discussion in international fora, including the OECD, regarding information exchange and the International Consumer Product Safety Caucus regarding issues such as traceability and recall effectiveness. She closed by highlighting three main challenges moving forward. First, work should be undertaken to standardize the main test methods laid down in the EN, ASTM, and ISO standards; this would simplify the rules for manufacturers and facilitate compliance. Second, mutually compatible traceability systems should be developed in order to employ better recall effectiveness. Third, enforcement activities should be moved closer to the point of manufacturer. She noted that action on these issues will require effort by both regulators and businesses.

¹⁰ Due to developments that required her to remain in Washington, Chairman Tenenbaum's remarks were presented in video format.

Report to Stakeholders Panel. Moderator: Mr. Martin Rushton, Principal Advisor- Measurement and Product Safety Service, Ministry of Consumer Affairs, New Zealand

- *Ms. Julia Doherty, Senior Director of Non-tariff Measures, United States Trade Representative*, reviewed the outcomes from the Singapore Regulator Dialogue on Toy Safety. She discussed the mandate and key goals of the initiative; increasing transparency, promoting better alignment, and reducing unnecessary obstacles to trade.
- *Mr. Rich O'Brien, Director, Office of International Programs and Intergovernmental Affairs, U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission*, released the findings of the APEC Toy Safety Survey. All 21 economies provided answers allowing for a systematic overview of toy safety requirements in the region.
- *Mr. Christian Wetterberg, Chairman, ISO Technical Committee 181, "Safety of Toys"*, gave an overview of the current work underway in the CEN, ASTM, and ISO toy safety committees. He described the new ISO Advisory Panel which will undertake the early identification and monitoring of emerging hazards worldwide and recommend preliminary work items to the ISO/TC 181 committee. He noted that the key to future and retroactive standards alignment is a closer relationship between the standards bodies.

Consumer Discussion Panel. Moderator: Mr. Christian Wetterberg, Chairman, ISO Technical Committee 181, "Safety of Toys"

This panel reviewed the role of consumer groups in standards development.

- *Ms. Sally Greenberg, Executive Director, National Consumers League* discussed the role that consumers play in the creation of toy safety standards. She also discussed the most recent developments in toy safety standards in the United States under the CPSIA.
- *Ms. Monica Cui, Executive Director, Safe Kids China*, discussed Safe Kids China collection of data on toy-related injuries and consumer concerns. Their information revealed that the following packaging information was the most important to consumers: safety alert information; age grading; material content; producer contact; and use of an authorized mark. She noted a need for greater consumer awareness of product recall information.
- *Ms. Ratna Devi Nadarajan, Malaysian Association of Standards Users and ISO COPOLCO Representative* discussed how COPOLCO helps to guide to the development of international standards. She also touched on the outcomes of the COPOLCO toy survey which focused on the worldwide use of the ISO standard.

Manufacturer Best Practices Discussion Panel. Moderator: Ms. Ruth MacKay General Manager, Product Safety Hazard Response Branch, Australian Competition and Consumer Commission

This panel focused on measures and methods that retailers, toy companies and manufacturers employ to ensure toy safety.

- *Ms. Kitty Pilarz, Senior Director, Mattel Product Safety, Fisher-Price* outlined how Mattel builds safety into its product integrity process from product conception through post production. The company gathers information about how children play with their toys, including unforeseen usage, through its in-house child research play laboratory. Experts from Mattel share that information with colleagues through their participation in the ASTM, CEN, and ISO toy safety committees.
- *Mr. TS Wong, Managing Director, Jetta Company Limited* discussed toy safety from a licensed manufacturer point of view and described how the production of a single toy requires verification to different safety requirements. He also discussed how a toy deemed safe for market "A" is non-saleable in market "B" because of different safety standards. He called for a harmonized safety standard and testing method in APEC.

- *Mr. Martin J. Cahill, Vice President, Quality Assurance, Hasbro* gave an overview of Hasbro's robust product safety assurance system from product concept to production, and detailed the company's factory process control system. He emphasized the importance of engineering safety at the design phase of a new toy.
- *Ms. Maureen Logghe, DG Enterprise and Industry, International Regulatory Agreements, Toys Safety, CSR, European Commission* discussed the new Toy Safety Directive 2009/48/EC and the link to other community legislation, such as REACH (regulation 1907/2006) and CLP (regulation 1272/2008).

Conformity Assessment Models, Opportunities and Obstacles for Greater Alignment.

Moderator: Mr. Carter Keithley, President, Toy Industry Association

This panel reviewed rules and best practices relating to the design and implementation of conformity assessment procedures.

- *Mr. Erik Wijkstrom, Counsellor, World Trade Organization* discussed current work in the Technical Barriers to Trade Committee regarding toys and explained WTO principles on conformity assessment systems including non-discrimination, transparency, and that regulatory requirements address legitimate objectives. He noted that when WTO Members raise trade concerns in the TBT Committee regarding toys, these concerns are often related to conformity assessment procedures.
- *Mr. Terence Chan, Chair, Asia Pacific Laboratory Accreditation Cooperation* explained how the APLAC mutual recognition arrangement provides a cost effective solution to regulators in recognizing test results. Regulators using the MRA can minimize administrative overhead and costs of testing, and speed up product market access time without compromising the protection for consumers.
- *Mr. Martin Rushton, Principal Advisor- Measurement and Product Safety Service, Ministry of Consumer Affairs New Zealand* discussed New Zealand's approach to product safety which stresses openness, information sharing, and ongoing threat assessment.
- *Mr. Peter Trillingsgaard, the LEGO Group, Chairman of CEN TC 52: Safety of Toys*, detailed conformity assessment procedures under the European Union's Toy Safety Directive. Conformity assessment is required for all toys and is either undertaken by the manufacturer or by a 3rd party depending on the situation.
- *Ms. Myung Kang-Huneke, Executive Vice President, General Counsel, and Secretary, Sesame Workshop* described the challenges a licensing company faces in ensuring product safety. She also discussed her company's plans for creating its own safety assurance plan.

Regulator Panel Discussion. Moderator: Mr. Ian Anderson, Acting Director of Operations, ICTI CARE Foundation Asia Limited

This panel was asked to reflect on the perspectives exchanged in the earlier sessions of the "Open Dialogue." Developed and developing economy perspectives of toy safety were shared.

Eight economies participated and were represented by their regulatory agencies as outlined below.

- Canada- *Mr. Robert Ianaro, Director Consumer Product Safety Bureau, Health Canada*
- China- *Ms. Qin Yuan, Official, Department of Supervision General Administration of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine*
- European Union- *Ms. Maureen Logghe, DG Enterprise and Industry, International Regulatory Agreements, Toys Safety, CSR*

- Indonesia- *Mr. Budi Irmawan, Director of Multifarious Industry, Directorate General of Metal, Machinery, Electronic and Multifarious Industry, Department of Industry*
- Japan- *Mr. Shigekazu Fukunaga, Deputy Director, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry*
- Malaysia- *Ministry of Domestic Trade, Co-operatives and Consumerism*
- Mexico- *Mr. Carlos Cardenas Ocampo, Chief of Department of Electric-Electronics, National Laboratory of the Mexican Consumer Protection Federal Agency*
- United States- *Mr. Richard O'Brien, Director, Office of International Programs and Intergovernmental Affairs, U.S. Consumer Product Safety Commission*
- Vietnam- *Mr. Tran Quoc Tuan, Deputy Director, Department for Goods Quality Control Directorate for Standards, Metrology and Quality*

Closing Remarks

Industry Perspective

Mr. Gerald Storch, Chairman & CEO Toys "R" Us, Inc, provided closing remarks about the internal process controls his company employs to ensure the toys it sells are safe for consumers.

Government Perspective

Ms. Julia Doherty, Vice Chair, APEC SCSC, recapped the key themes of the Open Dialogue and recommended that the key stakeholder groups undertake the following actions:

Regulators

- Tap into others' knowledge by making the choice to reach out to APEC and other regulators when contemplating new or amended toy safety regulations.
- Consider solutions with an established record of effectiveness in the global marketplace.
- Use the Specialized Regional Bodies within APEC (APLAC, PAC, APLMF, APMP) to learn more about how international systems of conformity assessment can help you achieve your goals.
- Find ways in which international organizations, such as the International Consumer Product Safety Caucus (ICPSC), and the OECD Consumer Policy Committee can advance cooperation and consultation among regulators in key areas – such as risk assessment, transparency, public consultation, better alignment, etc.

Toy industry

- Become leaders in private sector organizations and associations including standards organizations to advance the goal of trade in safe toys, and use international organizations such as the International Council of Toy Industries (ICTI) and the International Consumer Product Health and Safety Organization (ICPHSO) as a means to further your goals in toy safety.
- Develop forward looking strategies, and commit resources towards specific priorities to achieve greater standards alignment.
- Talk with your government representatives to find out how industry and regulatory policies in toy safety can support shared goals.

Standards bodies

- Sustain the momentum of greater coordination on work on emerging hazards among the key technical committees.
- Meet as members of the Pacific Area Standards Congress prior to ISO/IEC meetings on toy safety.
- Cultivate your relationships with the technical experts who are your peers in other standards bodies.

Consumers

- Consider ways in which your group can contribute to effective and accurate risk communication at home and internationally.
- Encourage ways to have consumers participate in standards development and on how to comment on draft regulations.

APEC SCSC

- Transmit APEC Toy Safety Initiative Survey and reports to other interested organizations and stakeholders, including the WTO, the OECD, ICPHSO, etc.
- Work with OECD to implement one or more recommendations from its recent report on product safety information sharing, focusing on recommendations that align closely with APEC needs identified during the course of the Toy Safety Initiative project.
- Inform the Pacific Area Standards Congress, the Asia Pacific Laboratory Accreditation Cooperation of the value of furthering dialogue with domestic stakeholders, including regulators, to advance understanding of the role of international standards and international accreditation system.
- Reconvene stakeholders of the APEC Toy Safety Initiative in 2011 to review progress.

Appendix: Recommendations to the APEC SCSC: Results of the post-Hong Kong outreach.

The following tables summarize the suggestions for future work items.

Emboldened topics indicate main areas of interest.

| Category | Number in support of the issue |
|---|--------------------------------|
| Align Standards ('Align Regulations might arguably be one and the same) | 4 |
| Align Regulations | 1 |
| Contact List | 3 |
| Standardize Age Grades | 1 |
| Standardize label information | 1 |
| Align Recall Actions | 1 |
| Guidelines on Post Market Surveillance | 1 |
| Share toy safety information between local agencies via a key contact agency | 2 |
| Develop an Online Forum / Extranet | 6 |
| Laboratory Testing – Training / Standards | 1 |
| Standards and Conformity Assessment – participation of developing economies | 1 |
| Consumer Education | 1 |
| Align Risk Assessment | 2 |
| Develop a timeline for standard alignment | 1 |
| APEC warning system for non compliant products | 1 |
| Technical Support / Capacity Building | 1 |
| Achieve understanding on enforcement of technical regulation within APEC | 1 |
| Develop a website to help raise public awareness | 1 |

Results by Category (Second Cut Analysis):

| Category | Number in support of the issue |
|---|---------------------------------------|
| Align Standards & Regulations (e.g. age grades / label information) – set timetable for alignment - Standards and Conformity Assessment – participation of developing economies – risk assessment and recall actions | 12 |
| Develop an Online Forum / Extranet - Share toy safety information between local agencies (e.g. APEC warning system for non compliant products) – contact list | 12 |
| Technical Support / Capacity Building – understanding around enforcement of regulation - Laboratory Testing – Training / Standards - Achieve understanding on enforcement of technical regulation within APEC - Guidelines on Post Market Surveillance | 3 |
| Consumer Education - Develop a website to help raise public awareness | 2 |

The table below compares the responses from the post-Hong Kong outreach with the OECD Information Sharing Report. It is recommended that the SCSC consider sponsoring future items that could establish linkages between the APEC Toy Safety Initiative and the ICPS and OECD.

| APEC Toy Safety Identified Need | APEC No. of Responses | OECD Information Sharing Report Conclusions |
|--|------------------------------|--|
| Develop an Online Forum / Extranet | 12 | Internet site that pools public product safety recall and alert information from multiple jurisdictions (short term action) |
| Develop an Online Forum / Extranet | 12 | Internet site that pools other important public product safety information from multiple jurisdictions (short-medium term action) |
| Develop an Online Forum / Extranet | 12 | Internet site for product safety officials that provides information necessary to governments to coordinate international product safety initiatives (short-medium term) |
| Alignment – of standards and regulations | 12 | Regulators should continue to organize themselves at regional and global levels to better understand and coordinate product safety policies (short term) |
| Develop an Online Forum / Extranet | 12 | Internet site for the public that pools government sanctioned studies on product safety issues (medium term) |
| Consumer Education - Develop a website to help raise public awareness | 2 | Internet site for the public that pools information on new product safety regulatory and legislative initiatives from around the world (medium term) |
| Development of Online Forum / Extranet | 12 | Internet site for product safety officials containing names and contact information of government subject matter experts (medium term) |
| Consumer Education - Develop a website to help raise public awareness | 2 | Internet site for the public (possibly with a non-public section?) where injury data is pooled after being drawn automatically from the sites operated by multiple jurisdictions. The project would begin with agreement on a minimum protocol for the source data |

| | | |
|---|-----------|---|
| | | sets. (longer term) |
| Development of Online Forum / Extranet | 12 | Internet site for product safety officials to share research underway and solicit input from other jurisdictions. (longer term) |
| Alignment – of standards and regulations | 12 | Increase regulatory coordination on product tracking and traceability work (longer term) |